

Report on the Online Consultations by Safecity for the Global Compact on Migration

by Adriana Rakshana*, Nikunj Morarka** and Vandita Morarka***

Policy and Legal Team,
Safecity: Red Dot Foundation

[Safecity](#) is an initiative of Red Dot Foundation, which aims to make cities safer by encouraging equal access to public spaces for everyone, especially women and girls, through the use of crowdsourced data, community engagement and institutional accountability. Our [crowdmap](#) aggregates incidents of sexual harassment in public spaces and creates hotspots at locations with higher intensity of such incidents.

Red Dot Foundation has received special accreditation to the Global Compact preparatory process for Migration by the United Nations Member States. In accordance with United Nations General Assembly resolution 71/1, the "New York Declaration for Refugees and Migrants," a preparatory process is underway for the intergovernmental negotiations of a global compact for safe, orderly and regular migration, to be adopted at an intergovernmental conference on international migration in 2018. As part of this preparatory process, the President of the General Assembly organised a series of informal thematic sessions between April 2017 and November 2017, as well as four days of informal interactive multi-stakeholder hearings between April 2017 and June 2018, in accordance with the organisational arrangements adopted by the UN General Assembly.

To ensure that while making our submissions we could be representative of as many voices as possible, Safecity organised online consultations on the following themes:

- 1. June:** International cooperation and governance of migration in all its dimensions, including at borders, on transit, entry, return, readmission, integration and reintegration.
- 2. July:** Contributions of migrants and diasporas to all dimensions of sustainable development, including remittances and portability of earned benefits.
- 3. September:** Smuggling of migrants, trafficking in persons and contemporary forms of slavery, including appropriate identification, protection and assistance to migrants and trafficking victims

*Adriana Rakshana is a Research Assistant at Safecity.

**Nikunj Morarka is a Research Assistant at Safecity.

***Vandita Morarka is the Policy, Legal and United Liaisons Officer at Safecity.

- 4. October:** Irregular migration and regular pathways, including decent work, labour mobility, recognition of skills and qualifications and other relevant measures.

Methodology

Our questionnaires for the online consultations were formulated with inputs from experts in the area of migration and related issues and policy as well as extensive internal research. We would especially like to thank Kirthi Jayakumar, Founder of Red Elephant Foundation, and Jason Jeremias, Founder and Executive Director of Price of Silence, for their valuable inputs towards framing the questionnaires for the online consultations. These questionnaires were later circulated digitally via email, social media platforms and through our website, to get inputs from a large audience. These inputs and corresponding research has helped us formulate this report.

June Online Consultation Report

International cooperation and governance of migration in all its dimensions, including at borders, on transit, entry, return, readmission, integration and reintegration.

What are the governmental/national level frameworks that are needed to improve equity in migration for jobs/employment opportunities?

There has always been discrimination based on race and ethnicity in migration policies of countries, even when such discrimination is no longer mandated by law it is practised by officers in charge of migration, so the best way to ensure equity for potential migrants is to have an objective and merit based standard for selecting migrants for employment opportunities, this can be done through standardised tests and other quantitative educational and work criteria.

How does the lack of international cooperation on migration policies affect the lives of migrants fleeing from conflict zones?

Countries facing an influx of migrants from a conflict zone may bar the entry of these migrants by sealing their borders which could have devastating consequences for the migrants. This can be prevented if neighbouring countries reach an agreement to accept certain quotas of refugees and other countries agree to compensate the affected country or provide material support. Furthermore, migrant families may get split and reach different countries during the conflict, in such a situation not having international cooperation would make it impossible to unite these families.

How does the lack of international cooperation on migration policies affect the lives of female migrants specifically, fleeing from conflict zones?

Female migrants are even more vulnerable in such a scenario, they are almost always less educated and mostly dependent on male members of their family, in case they are separated, not having international cooperation to help find their family will put them in grave danger. Furthermore, if there is no cooperation and refugee camps and other infrastructure is not created the absence of lavatories and lack of access to sanitary pads can have serious health consequences for women.

What are the additional ramifications that the business of transporting migrants illegally has for female migrants?

How do we address these issues? Mostly the women who take the help of these illegal traffickers are in a desperate economic position, any agreement they have with these traffickers is totally one sided in favour of the traffickers and even then these women have no way to enforce any agreement and are totally at their mercy. The transport and work conditions are extremely unhealthy and many a times they may be forced into slavery or be exploited sexually. All nations must cooperate to strengthen their borders and use the latest technology to detect illegal border crossing and smuggling. It is very important that they share intelligence and crack down on complicit officers and have harsh laws against these traffickers and a humane rehabilitation policy for the female migrants.

How will an internationally accepted policy on cooperation towards migrants help reduce the business of transporting migrants across borders illegally?

Intelligence sharing between the countries will help track the routes used by these businesses and so help crack down on them. Such cooperation will help expose rogue states that refuse to co-operate and help harbour such traffickers. Sharing of advanced technology by the more developed countries will help the less developed countries secure their borders.

How can we build migrant policies that are inclusive and multicultural?

All nations must agree to a migration policy that is based on merit and doesn't discriminate against anyone based on their religion, race or ethnicity. Such a merit based system may help the migrants of advanced economies and so to make sure that the less developed countries are not left out there must be certain quotas for these countries.

How does the lack of a clear internationally accepted policy on citizenship rights of migrants affect their lives post displacement?

Not having a clear internationally accepted policy on citizenship rights of migrants makes the live of these migrants unstable and leaves them open to exploitation. They can be deported for relatively minor offences if they aren't citizens. They are also unable to get proper access to education and healthcare facilities and are often paid lower wages and exploited by their employers.

How does the lack of a clear internationally accepted policy on immigration of migrants affect their lives post settlement in a country?

The absence of an international policy on immigration of migrants makes it possible for countries to put harsh restrictions on migrants like restricting their movement. They can force them to learn the native language, allow employers to pay these migrants low wages and also deny them access to certain education and healthcare facilities. These migrants are also vulnerable to being deported for minor mistakes without an international agreement.

Should the governance of migration policies for migrants driven away from their homes by climate change be entrusted to the countries the migrants emerge from or to the other countries?

Who should bear costs of such migration? Climate change is the responsibility of every country in the world and so all countries must create a climate fund specifically for migrants displaced by climate change, the more advanced countries must contribute more money since they are not only in a better financial condition but have also historically caused the highest levels of emissions. The country that has received the migrants should support these migrants and if they don't have the capacity then they must distribute the migrants among neighbouring countries and they must be compensated by the climate fund, which should be overseen by the United Nations.

Would compelling refugees to learn the native language of the country they migrate to, help or further alienate their integration process?

If there is a compulsion to learn the native language then it might cause further stress to the migrants who are already under tremendous pressure. The best approach would be to provide them free classes to learn the native language without there being a compulsion to clear a language test.

What steps should be taken to rehabilitate the refugees in their country of origin after the crisis which caused the migration has ended?

Who should bear the costs for the same? Such rehabilitation should take place only after the crisis has ended and the country is stable, with the approval of the government in charge of the country. This must be done in a systematic manner, first the country of origin must build the

required infrastructure to house the migrants and provide educational and medical facilities. The United Nations must do a thorough investigation of the conditions and only then must the migrants be transferred to their country of origin. The costs must be borne by the country of origin and the countries that caused this crisis if this is economically viable, or else other countries through the United Nations must help these countries either materially, through low interest loans or donations.

What is the viability of safe zones for refugee camps in conflict zones like Syria and who should provide funding and security for these camps?

These safe zones are only viable if the major powers on either side of the war agree not to attack these safe zones otherwise they can't work. The funding and security should mainly be provided by the countries that are involved in the crisis and the support of international organisations like the Red Cross must be allowed.

How do we tackle the rise of religious profiling of refugees with rising acceptance of anti-refugee sentiment in politics?

Educating the public through advertising and public programs by informing them about the fact that the overwhelming majority of Muslims are peaceful and that Muslims are the largest victims of terror attacks is very important. While all countries have the right to do a background check of the migrants there must be an international agreement where all countries agree to that they won't disallow migrants entry based on their religion alone.

How can we make a universal standard of entry in emergency situations that expedites allocation of visas?

All countries with diplomatic relations must agree to provide visas on an expedited basis for medical emergencies, in case the person who is asking for the visa is suspected of some crime or the place where he/she comes from is a terror prone zone then the country can monitor this person when they arrive in the country but they should be provided with the visa for their medical emergency. After the person is operated upon he/she can then be detained for questioning.

How do we become more innovative in protecting paths and roads that we know are taken by migrants to ensure their safety in transit?

We can monitor these paths through drones and have military aircrafts on standby to respond to threats in minutes and also provide material help to the migrants by dropping food packets.

How do we engineer a new framework that tackles the UN administrative conventions in conjunction with the International Organisation of Migration, in practice, as it relates to national sovereignty?

The reality is that the United Nations by itself doesn't have the power to enforce any migration policy without the support of member states, so the IOM must continue to provide consultation to countries and push for more rights for migrants without interfering in the politics of any country because that is the only way member states of the United Nations will trust the IOM and take its help to expand migration rights or facilitate migration at times of a crisis.

July Online Consultation Report

Contributions of migrants and diasporas to all dimensions of sustainable development, including remittances and portability of earned benefits.

Migration has important implications on both the origin country and the host country. Many host countries have problems integrating migrants with regards to the workforce as well as culture and health outcomes. This specific consultation concerns itself primarily with the contributions of the migrants to the host country, however we shall also consider both sides of the issue by answering the key questions posed in the consultation forms. This [paper](#) that talks about the impact of migration on Economic and Social Development is very pertinent to the discussion for July so it would be worth to investigate for further information beyond what is highlighted in this report. “Glocalizing Women’s Health and Safety: Migration, Work, and Labor,” a paper by UF Law talks about the problems faced by migrant women in detail and can aid the dialogue about these issues in the broader talks about diaspora as well.

What are the financial costs and benefits of migration to the host country?

- Migrants can contribute increased efficiency in the use of global resources as well as broader perspectives on various platforms.
- There is also an increase in savings, investment and human capital formation in general which can in turn increase the pace of innovation for the host country.
- Higher education and training can help migrants establish themselves in the developed host country and thus flourish and aid in its development.
- Immigration increases the supply of labor, which increases employment, production and thus GDP of the host country, thus beneficial.
- Increased mobility of workers has contributed to a rapid spread of communicable diseases such as HIV. For example, Kane et al. (1993) find that 27 percent of the male Senegalese migrants were HIV positive compared to 1 percent for non-migrants males from the same area.

- The costs of assimilating and integrating migrants usually falls on to the governments of the host country and it can be onerous to split resources between both migrants and the native population.
- To quote the [Issue Brief](#) from the UN Refugees report, “the contribution of migrants to the development of their countries of origin goes far beyond financial remittances, including transfers of skills and knowledge, entrepreneurship, trade, investments, network building, bridging cultural divides and breaking down gender stereotypes”
- From the Global Compact Consultation Report on the [SDG Knowledge Hub](#) - “UN agencies highlighted the economic and social contributions of migrants to their countries of origin and destination, including the remittance of US\$429 billion to their countries of origin in 2016. UN Special Representative for International Migration, Louise Arbour, described such remittances as a tangible contribution of migrants to achieving the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) in developing countries”

What are the financial costs and benefits of the migration process to the migrants and origin country?

- Migration can present a threat to migrant health as certain jobs expose migrants to occupational hazards, such as tuberculosis, pneumoconiosis and workplace injury by mine workers.
- The benefits and costs also vary with the level of economic development of the country of origin. A key issue of worry for origin countries tends to be brain drain that deals with the loss of skill and innovation. This is accompanied by the loss of a labour force due to the movement of skills at all levels.
- Income from remittances is generally spent on education and health which can be helpful to the origin country. However, the average charge for the transfer of remittances is around 13-20% which causes migrants to use informal means of transfer.

What is the role of the diaspora in promoting trade and investments?

- Migrant workers can create important networks that encourage the exchange of knowledge and skill and investment between the countries.

Will reducing the cost of migration improve levels of migration within a country? If so, is it a short term remedy or is the cost reduction sustainable for both the host and source country?

- Multiple entry visas, long-term residence permits and dual citizenship can increase mobility of diaspora members which can help the worker be an active participant in both communities.
- Origin countries can adopt incentive schemes and create better employment programs in order to encourage skilled manpower to return and improve the country. This can be done through reintegration schemes that account for housing, healthcare and education for the members and their families.

What common issues do most migrants face when entering the labour force?

- Migrants are often forced to work at much lower positions than their skill level allows given their qualifications are not recognized in different countries and they have to start at a lower work level despite possessing higher skill levels.
- Stringent visa requirements and limited access to resources to aid in the process of both entering the country as well as applying to join the workforce can be problematic.
- These problems faced by the migrants translate to economic losses for both the migrants as well as the host country.

What issues do women face with migration?

- Women account for half of the migrant population and more women are encouraged to migrate to different countries as independent workers. This is facilitated by the increase in the access to information. Generally women are relegated to care and welfare related professions.
- It is interesting to note that migrant workers in general, and in particular migrant women, have higher labour participation rates than their non-migrant counterparts: 72.7% to 63.9% and 67% to 50.8% respectively.¹ Migration also allows women to escape instability and to enjoy more equal social conditions, and to avoid discrimination, as well as to provide better living conditions and support for their children. However, women migrants experience difficult working conditions, low pay, illegal withholding of wages, and sexual abuses that include sexual slavery according to the Santa Clara Journal of International Law.

¹ <http://scholarship.law.ufl.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1787&context=facultypub>

- Nonetheless, women are vulnerable even in government-run camps and shelters, especially in those where there are no sex-segregated sleeping, bathroom, or shower facilities and in which none of the facilities can be locked from the inside. Centers are overcrowded and the facilities often lack the most basic sanitary conditions, health and safety. Some even reported not eating or drinking for extended periods of time if they felt unsafe going to use the sanitary facilities. Pregnant women reported lack of food and absence of any healthcare.
- Segregated shelters also have their own problems as they tend to separate families as well as alienate transgendered migrants who are often sorted based on their biological sex rather than their gender identity.

September Online Consultation Report

Smuggling of migrants, trafficking in persons and contemporary forms of slavery, including appropriate identification, protection and assistance to migrants and trafficking victims.

What is the basic level of security and checks that countries must maintain to curb human trafficking across their borders? What action must be taken against countries that fail to maintain this level of security?

The [UN Protocol to Prevent, Suppress, and Punish Trafficking in Persons](#) established a [universal trafficking definition](#) and set a goal for countries to prevent and combat trafficking and assist victims. Something that can be adopted to help curb human trafficking from Massachusetts is the [Human Trafficking Task Force](#), which strengthens protections for victims of trafficking and makes using the internet as a trafficking tool a punishable offense. It is important for all countries to continue raising awareness about human trafficking, work to establish special anti-trafficking courts, and file and prosecute cases on the local level.

What is the responsibility of the country where the migrant is trafficked to and where the migrant is trafficked from, towards the migrant?

The country where the migrant is trafficked to and where the migrant is trafficked from, both, have immense responsibility towards the migrant with regards to their safety and security. Improving the efficacy of Anti-Trafficking task units as well as providing appropriate levels of legal support to victims will go a long way toward protecting future victims.

What should be the basic guidelines towards victims of human trafficking when they are rescued or arrested? What rights should they have?

According to the Recommended Principles and Guidelines on Human Rights and Human Trafficking by the Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights, “Trafficked persons shall not be detained, charged or prosecuted for the illegality of their entry into or residence in countries of transit and destination, or for their involvement in unlawful activities to the extent that such involvement is a direct consequence of their situation as trafficked persons. States shall ensure that trafficked persons are protected from further exploitation and harm and have

access to adequate physical and psychological care. Such protection and care shall not be made conditional upon the capacity or willingness of the trafficked person to cooperate in legal proceedings.” These seem to be some basic rights that need to be upheld in any and all situations. The OHCHR has the complete comprehensive guide on such issues².

Should employment agencies that facilitate the travel of migrants to other countries for work be allowed to withhold their passport and visa for security purposes? Should these countries be able to restrict the freedom of movement of these migrant workers?

In partnership with non-governmental organizations, ensuring that trafficked persons who do return to their country of origin are provided with the assistance and support necessary to ensure their well-being, facilitate their social integration and prevent re-trafficking is important. Measures should be taken to ensure the provision of appropriate physical and psychological health care, housing and educational and employment services for returned trafficking victims. These recommendations are outlined in the OHCHR guide.

What frameworks can we develop to ensure that all countries share intelligence about human trafficking routes and the main groups involved in trafficking within their borders? Should economic sanctions be imposed on countries that refuse to divulge such information?

“Ensuring that law enforcement personnel are provided with adequate training in the investigation and prosecution of cases of trafficking. This training should be sensitive to the needs of trafficked persons, particularly those of women and children, and should acknowledge the practical value of providing incentives for trafficked persons and others to come forward to report traffickers. The involvement of relevant non-governmental organizations in such training should be considered as a means of increasing its relevance and effectiveness.”

How can we adequately capture the compulsory forces and vulnerabilities that migrant women are exposed to (the most extreme case being that of trafficking) without casting them as victims with no agency in migration decisions and processes?

Sensitizing police, prosecutors, border, immigration and judicial authorities, and social and public health workers to the problem of trafficking and ensuring the provision of specialized

² <http://www.ohchr.org/Documents/Publications/Traffickingen.pdf>

training in identifying trafficking cases, combating trafficking and protecting the rights of victims. Encouraging law enforcement authorities to work in partnership with nongovernmental agencies in order to ensure that trafficked persons receive necessary support and assistance³.

What are the trade-offs involved and what role do legal frameworks and public policies play in enhancing or undermining women's ability to make meaningful choices in the context of migration and mobility and in exiting oppressive relationships post-migration?

If legal frameworks and public policies do not account for the difficulties encountered by the migrant women in various avenues, it can be extremely problematic and terribly difficult for migrant women to adjust to life and relationships post the ordeal of migration.

³ <http://www.ohchr.org/Documents/Publications/Traffickingen.pdf>

October Online Consultation Report

Irregular migration and regular pathways, including decent work, labour mobility, recognition of skills and qualifications and other relevant measures.

GFMD Dialogue on the Global Compact for Safe, Orderly and Regular Migration provides information on this specific working session for the roundtable discussions and thematic workshops on related issues. Further information on this specific issue can be found [here](#).

How do we increase migrant mobility between states and encourage assimilation into the labour workforce?

Making migration paperwork and bureaucratic procedures much less onerous on migrants as well as allowing for better workplace assimilation for migrants in different sectors of work would help increase mobility.

How do we provide more legal pathways for migration?

A pilot project on resettlement in order to increase the number of places offered to persons in need of protection like what is established in the EU would be helpful. This would work in conjunction with improved screening that would allow better legal pathways for migration.

How can we decrease the information asymmetry between migrants seeking work and work opportunities?

Information to be provided to migrants at all stages of the migration process. In parallel, awareness raising campaigns in the destination countries could inform the public about migrants' contribution to their development.

How do we ensure prevention of sexual violence during migrants' transition?

Strengthening the capacity of national institutions is critical to ensuring accountability for past crimes, as well as prevention and deterrence for the future⁴. Proper monitoring of migration

⁴ <http://www.un.org/en/events/elimination-of-sexual-violence-in-conflict/pdf/1494280398.pdf>

routes and ensuring potential perpetrators are made aware of the consequences of their actions would help prevent some level of sexual violence.

How do we address sexual violence that occurs during migration?

A comprehensive medical check-up, protection from further harm, timely referral to appropriate services like psychosocial support, provision of emergency contraception and STI prevention e.g. HIV post-exposure prophylaxis, follow-up care and support plan, confidential, supportive and nonjudgmental services, a gender-sensitive sexual assault care training for health care providers and sexual assault care service provision integrated with other health care services should be offered within the health realm⁵.

What measures can be taken by the source country to encourage ease of transition into work in the host country?

Explore policy options to create more safe and legal channels for migrants to move in safety. There need to be sustainable policies and strategic partnerships with international institutions, government and civil society organisations to prevent irregular and potentially dangerous migratory movements.

Develop global, regional and bilateral agreements that promote human mobility between States and which also provide flexibility to migrants to move between different mobility pathways, including seasonal, temporary or circular migration.

Promoting government-to-government collaboration and public-private partnerships to enable skills and qualifications recognition that facilitates labour mobility.

In what ways and to what extent can encouraging more legal forms of migration help reduce irregular migration?

Information to be provided to migrants at all stages of the migration process. In parallel, awareness raising campaigns in the destination countries could inform the public about migrants' contribution to their development. Promote adherence to international laws, while ensuring that human trafficking and smuggling is prevented, enhance closer collaboration on data-sharing and migration management between law enforcement and labor administration

5

http://www.euro.who.int/__data/assets/pdf_file/0018/319311/9-Sexual-violence-refugee-women.pdf?ua=1

apparatus, and implement interventions viewed at raising and enhancing protection of vulnerable persons.

Should migration applications be gender blind? To what extent do migration policies need to be more reflective of gender differences?

Applications can be gender aware rather than gender sensitive in that the gender is a part of a holistic analysis and screening to help enact better migration policies reflective of different individuals.

What gender sensitive migration policies can be adopted in order to reduce negative effects of migration on labour prospects for both men and women?

Gender mainstreaming to be prioritized in migration policy, to anticipate and mitigate possible negative impacts for women and men during the migration process. This includes adoption of gender sensitive labor migration policies and practices ensuring decent working conditions; the establishment of gender sensitive support structures in destination countries; and improve gender-related data collection and analysis of the impact of migration on families.

Do the educational levels and the background of the migrant men and women matter in the migration process?

Education levels of the migrants should not be a primary concern when accepting migrants however background checks should still be conducted in order to obtain the information in order possibly facilitate the search for jobs.

You can write to us at info@safecity.in with any queries.